

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE THIRD CIRCUIT

---

No. 05-2345

---

BEATA A. STARK; NORMAN A. STARK;  
BEATA CLINICAL RESEARCH SERVICES,

*Appellants*

v.

EAR NOSE & THROAT SPECIALISTS OF NORTHWESTERN  
PENNSYLVANIA, P.C.; JACK B. ANON, INDIVIDUALLY;  
ROBERT BUDACKI, INDIVIDUALLY; SETH ANON, INDIVIDUALLY;  
ELLEN ANON; and OTHERS to be identified

---

On Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Western District of Pennsylvania  
(D.C. Civil No. 04-cv-00032E)  
District Judge: Honorable Sean J. McLaughlin

---

Submitted Pursuant to Third Circuit LAR 34.1(a)  
May 19, 2006

Before: RENDELL and VAN ANTWERPEN, *Circuit Judges*, and  
ACKERMAN, *Senior District Judge*. \*

\* The Honorable Harold A. Ackerman, Senior District Judge for the District of New Jersey, sitting by designation.

---

JUDGMENT

---

This cause came to be heard on the record from the United States District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania and was submitted pursuant to Third Circuit L.A.R. 34.1(a) on May 19, 2006. On consideration whereof, it is now hereby

ORDERED and ADJUDGED by this Court that the June 21, 2004 and March 31, 2005 Orders of the District Court are AFFIRMED. Costs to be taxed against Appellants. All of the above in accordance with the opinion of this Court.

ATTEST:

/s/ Marcia M. Waldron  
Clerk

DATED: May 19, 2006

Certified as a true copy and issued in lieu  
of a formal mandate on 6/12/06

  
Teste:  
Clerk, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit